

# Transnational Activism to Combat Trafficking in Persons

---

ANDREA M. BERTONE  
Associate Director  
College Park Scholars International Studies

---

THE SUMMER/FALL 2003 ISSUE of *The Brown Journal of World Affairs (Journal)* provided a forum for academics, healthcare professionals, policy makers, and practitioners to present the most pressing challenges to the combating of international trafficking in persons. Although the section of the journal was entitled “Sex Trafficking,” nearly all authors raised the important point that trafficking can be perpetrated not only for sexual exploitation (prostitution, sex tourism, mail-order brides, pornography, and militarized prostitution), but for other forms of labor exploitation, as well as for human organs and slavery (factory, agriculture, domestic servitude, and street begging). The authors agree that trafficking is a severe violation of human rights, a human security and a traditional state security issue, a global health risk, a perversion of the economic principles of supply and demand, and a highly politicized international issue which requires a great deal of collaboration, cooperation, and coordination to combat. The Dutch Ambassador, and Personal Representative of the Chairman in Office of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, Daan Everts, argues correctly in his article that trafficking needs to be tackled through a comprehensive approach, which addresses supply and demand.<sup>1</sup>

9

Though all the articles are well-written and extremely informative, and the breadth of the articles covers most major issues surrounding trafficking, the opprobrious nature of trafficking bears that it be discussed openly and often. The opportunity that I have been given to contribute something to this issue of the *Journal* signifies the necessity of a *dialogue* on the problems of trafficking and smuggling. Hopefully this will serve to de-sensationalize how trafficking has come to be portrayed in the media and by some

---

ANDREA M. BERTONE is the Associate Director of the living-learning community—College Park Scholars International Studies—at the University of Maryland. She is also the Associate Director of Project Hope International, a Washington, DC-based nonprofit organization advocating for NGOs in Thailand and the United States which combat trafficking.

---

Copyright © 2004 by the *Brown Journal of World Affairs*

ANDREA M. BERTONE

well-meaning activists and academics, allowing those who work with victims of trafficking, research the issue, and work to prevent trafficking, to operate in an atmosphere of trust and constant communication. Unfortunately, the intended result is not always achieved.

In this short article, I would like to highlight three themes which thread through the articles on trafficking in the previous issue of the *Journal*: sex trafficking versus labor trafficking, legalization versus abolition, and supply versus demand. I would like to do this within the context of transnational activism to combat trafficking in persons. I will raise questions concerning from where we have come, how our understanding of trafficking has changed over the last five years, and on whom we may continue to press for change. Fortunately, transnational activism to combat trafficking is bringing normative changes at the international and domestic levels which will hopefully lead to more sound policy initiatives.

#### TRANSNATIONAL ACTIVISM TO COMBAT TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS

10

Trafficking for sexual and labor exploitation has taken place for centuries. The degree of awareness of this exploitation has been in flux over the past century. The approaches in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries banned the international traffic in persons and conflated trafficking and the voluntary movement of women across borders for the purposes of prostitution. Prostitution was seen as a social evil. A succession of international instruments embodied this approach. These organizations included the International Agreement of 18 May 1904 for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, the 1910 International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, the 1921 International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic of Women and Children, and International Convention of 11 October 1933 for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women of Full Age. These instruments came to be increasingly criticized for failing to acknowledge and confront the less visible forms of coercion—economic, cultural, social, or psychological—which pushed women into prostitution. The 1949 United Nations Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others declared, for the first time in an international instrument, that prostitution and traffic in persons were “incompatible with the dignity and worth of the human person and endanger the welfare of the individual, family and the community,” and made no distinction between forced and voluntary prostitution.<sup>2</sup> The convention viewed the prostitute as a victim. Of course, these international legal instruments were responses to a sensationalistic period when many believed that white women in Europe and the United States were being kidnapped and taken to Africa and the Middle East to be sex slaves. There was no recognition that this

activity had taken place for centuries, involving non-Western peoples for other forms of the slave trade.

After the 1949 convention, this problem did not disappear, but the political will to confront it vanished. During the 1960s, '70s, and '80s, the international community remained strangely silent on the issues of sex trafficking, sex slavery, sex tourism, labor trafficking, involuntary servitude, and bonded labor. In 1979, Kathleen Barry re-introduced the topic to an academic audience in *Female Sexual Slavery*. She argued that trafficking for prostitution was very much alive during the 1960s and 1970s. Evidence suggested that high level officials in certain countries were directly involved with trafficking women from developing countries for the purposes of sexual slavery. Barry shows that INTERPOL knew of these problems from reports the group made at international meetings in the 1970s, however the report material never made its way to the public.<sup>3</sup> In the 1970's and '80s, international NGOs such as Anti-Slavery International tried unsuccessfully to bring these problems to the attention of the media.

**Trafficking for sexual and labor exploitation has taken place for centuries. The degree of awareness of this exploitation has been in flux over the past century.**

Fortunately, domestic women's movements ascended in the 1970s and 1980s, and forums for discussions opened. At a global level, the United Nations' International Decade for Women 1975-1985 catalyzed both activism and research on female sexual slavery. However, the 1979 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) did not address trafficking directly. Instead, CEDAW initially addressed problems of political discrimination, which at the time were of greater concern to Western women than non-Western women.

In 1983, Kathleen Barry, Charlotte Bunch, and Shirley Castley organized a Global Feminist Workshop to Organize against Traffic in Women. Thirty-four women from twenty-four countries, half from the developing world, gathered for a week in Rotterdam to document and strategize solutions to female sexual slavery. The organizers wished to create a transnational network against trafficking, though no network emerged at that time. The issue of traffic in women provoked strong debate between advocates of abolishing prostitution and advocates of less drastic positions. Third World women's resistance to having a Northern-based network generated further discord, but no organizations in the South could shoulder the financial burden of coordinating a network. The discussions between Western and non-Western women who attended this small workshop ended in a stalemate.<sup>4</sup>

Despite this deadlock, throughout the 1980s and '90s, the goal of combating

ANDREA M. BERTONE

violence against women continued to develop within the international women's movement. Many Asian NGOs campaigned against violence against women during four UN women's conferences, and one human rights conference between 1975 and 1995.

**The global campaign to combat trafficking clearly has benefited from the campaign on violence against women.**

The 1993 Vienna World Conference on Human Rights helped solidify the idea that "women's rights are human rights." At the Vienna conference, violence against women became a key issue among activists from all over the world.<sup>5</sup> According to Margaret Keck and Kathryn Sikkink, the issue of violence against women arrived late and dramatically in the in-

ternational women's movement. The matter differed from the more classic problems of suffrage, equality, and discrimination around which Western women had long mobilized.<sup>6</sup> These 'Western' problems did not resonate with women from developing countries who suffered from corrupt governments and Western economic policies that increased poverty, underdevelopment, and the commoditization of women. Violence against women emerged as a common advocacy position around which women's organizations could agree and collaborate.<sup>7</sup> This is easily explained, as practices which result in bodily harm to vulnerable individuals are most likely to mobilize transnational networks, especially where the causal chain between the perpetrator and the victim is short. Women's groups in the Third World pressed the issue of violence against women most forcefully, but they found support among groups working on similar women's issues in the West.<sup>8</sup> Finally, though the 1995 Beijing conference on Women solidified women's human rights discussions, conflict amongst activists persisted.<sup>9</sup>

The story of the emergence of violence against women as an international issue shows how two previously separate transnational networks around human rights and women's rights began to converge and mutually transform one another.<sup>10</sup> The network built around violence against women could draw upon pre-existing communication networks. The global campaign to combat trafficking clearly has benefited from the campaign on violence against women.<sup>11</sup> The issues of trafficking for sexual slavery and for labor, however, can be separated from the violence against women campaign because of the diversity of organizations that have become involved and because of the multi-disciplinary approach needed to combat trafficking. Trafficking issues have been debated in the international political arena since the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, but after 1949 the political will to address them lost momentum. Trafficking remained in the background until the campaign on violence against women, and then rode the wave of the international women's movement into the early 1990s.

12

**WHAT DOES THE CURRENT ACTIVISM LOOK LIKE?**

In the early to mid-1990s, trafficking in women for sexual exploitation slowly returned to the international political agenda. Other women's human rights issues such as female genital mutilation, women and development, and veiling also ascended to the international political arena. These crucial issues continue to be the focus of both activists and academics in the North and South. The interest in trafficking grew throughout the 1990s and has remained high on the international political agenda. While, as Frank Laczko and Marco Gramigna argue, available information about the magnitude of the problem remains largely unknown, it is generally agreed that globalization has increased trafficking.<sup>12</sup> Women's NGOs in the Third World and the West have proliferated tremendously and speak a common language of universal women's rights. In addition, simultaneous campaigns about issues involving sex slavery and sex tourism became entrenched in Asia and Europe. Often called transnational activism, these campaigns helped pressure governments to enact anti-trafficking laws and to reform the treatment of illegal nationals who are victims of trafficking. Sex tourism and militarized prostitution in Asia perpetrated by Westerners have also sparked a great deal of activism. Remarkably, the same Southeast Asian activists who increased awareness in the 1980s about the ill-effects of general tourism on children are still working in their home countries to combat sexual violence against women and children by foreigners. Thailand is an example of a country whose NGOs are highly organized and well-connected, and whose government has become a (somewhat flawed) regional leader in combating trafficking for sexual and labor exploitation.

In 1991, the Soviet Union collapsed, destabilizing Central and Eastern Europe. For some time, many feared a mass exodus of people looking for work out of these regions and into Western Europe. While a large number of people did make their way to Western Europe, the exodus did not materialize. A growing number of NGOs in Western Europe became aware of the traffic in women and children for sexual exploitation into the European Community. Some of these European NGOs had been working on trafficking issues since the late 1980s and were aware of the traffic in women from Eastern Europe. Others were linked with NGOs in Asia. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, NGOs in Asian countries such as Thailand and the Philippines began campaigning against sex tourism and child sexual exploitation by Westerners. It became apparent to an NGO named End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes (ECPAT) that a negative side of tourism in general was child sex tourism. At that point in the early 1990s, it was necessary for ECPAT in Bangkok to work with NGOs in Western Europe, the United States, and Australia, all of which were major sending regions for the sex tourists. The Global

ANDREA M. BERTONE

Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) was formed at the International Workshop on Migration and Traffic in Women held in Chiang Mai, Thailand in October 1994. Since that time, GAATW has grown into a movement of members consisting of

**Transnational NGO activity shows that no coherent strategy exists to address trafficking in females for sexual exploitation simply because it is such a complex issue.**

both organizations and individuals worldwide, and has coordinated, organized and facilitated work on issues related to trafficking in persons and women's labor migration in virtually every region of the world. Their aim is to ensure that the human rights of trafficked persons are respected and protected by authorities and agencies. Their strategy is to promote the

involvement of grassroots women in all work against trafficking in persons to ensure that any work done addresses the real problems. They work to empower women rather than treat them as victims. ECPAT and GAATW are just two examples of the many international NGOs which have spearheaded transnational campaigns against the international sex trade. The fact that these organizations were founded in a non-Western country is significant. Non-Western organizations could link with the Western organizations immediately because of previous networks and improved communication, making these campaigns truly global from the very beginning.

14

Transnational activism in areas such as the environment and traditional human rights has often followed a boomerang pattern of influence. The boomerang pattern happens when domestic NGOs bypass their inaccessible governments and directly search out international allies, usually NGOs in Western countries. These Western NGOs appeal to their own governments to try to pressure the inaccessible governments. Such networks provide access, leverage and information to less powerful Third World actors.<sup>13</sup> Interestingly, activism against trafficking shows unique ways that organizations build global and domestic awareness, and how they interact with their governments and across borders. Few, if any, governments sanction trafficking; however, many corrupt government officials are involved directly and indirectly with trafficking. Furthermore, ignoring trafficking is tantamount to condoning transnational organized crime. Activism targets changes in this governmental behavior.

If we take a look at the attempts to combat trafficking, we will see a fairly classic boomerang pattern.<sup>14</sup> In terms of the strategies of the international women's movement, framing the trafficking in females as an example of violence against women has helped to change global norms and bring world attention to this global phenomenon. However, transnational NGO activity shows that no coherent strategy exists to address trafficking in females for sexual exploitation simply because it is such a complex issue.

### *Transnational Activism to Combat Trafficking in Persons*

It can be addressed through multiple frames (cultural relativity, violence against women, prostitution, transnational crime, illegal migration), and there is no consensus between women's groups working on this issue. The divide which prevented the creation of a network to combat female sexual slavery in the early 1980s is more pronounced today because it plays out on a wider scale. Women's groups, activist NGOs, and now governments separate into two camps. One camp believes that all forms of prostitution, whether voluntary or involuntary, constitute violence against women, and must be abolished. Those in this camp sometimes conflate prostitution and trafficking in women. The other camp has taken the position that trafficking in women and children is an on-going problem. However, domestic and foreign women who choose to be sex workers in a particular country afford certain rights, and they advocate that prostitution should be legalized and regulated by the government.

#### **PROBLEMS WITH THE CAMPAIGN**

It is clear after studying this issue and its complexities for some time that in order for there to be progress made in addressing trafficking (assuming that the reduction of trafficking is a common theme) there must be a great deal of attention given by states. However, I argue that the current formulations of cooperation among states, NGOs, and international organizations (I call this a global governance structure) in the anti-trafficking campaign are not the most effective because there is no formal global coordination of their efforts and this lack of coordination may actually be exacerbating the problem.

Just in the last three years there has been a proliferation of countless organizations all over the world that are studying trafficking, creating trafficking initiatives, and advocating against trafficking. While this is a mostly positive development, some organizations are more useful and effective than others. The fact that there are so many organizations worldwide leads the campaign to assume a particular personality of extreme politicization from the local to global levels, and many organizations are vying for limited resources to combat trafficking. Because a number of powerful states have committed to fighting trafficking, NGOs from the Third World have to apply for funding from large donor organizations and states, through the U.S. State Department, for example. This means that the people in NGOs need to be aware of when the State Department releases its call for proposals, and must also have fluency in English.

But the reality of smaller NGOs working at the grass-roots level must be recognized. They struggle every day to combat trafficking by helping victims in a variety of ways. The smaller NGOs are dealing with the more human and humanitarian aspects of trafficking because they employ mostly social workers, doctors, activists, and re-

searchers. There are limitations to what these particular people can physically do to fight trafficking. The agendas of larger organizations can be different because they have more resources to tackle different problems, they have different donors to answer to, and they are subject to scrutiny by a larger number of people who monitor activities.

Many governments still respond to trafficking through restrictive policies that only make migrants more vulnerable to traffickers. The polices call for trafficked persons to be swiftly returned to their home countries as undocumented migrants and

**Current models prioritize the needs of law enforcement over the rights of trafficked persons.**

returned to the same conditions that they left, rather than be identified as a victim of a crime. Current models prioritize the needs of law enforcement over rights of trafficked persons. According to Anti-Slavery International, the best practices exist where there is genuine good will on the part of authorities.<sup>15</sup> Successful cases of

combating trafficking can be found when teams of law enforcement, prosecutors, lawyers, and service providers are involved simultaneously. In the vast majority of cases, however, trafficked persons are still seen by governments as criminals who live in a country illegally.

16

There is a need to institutionalize good practice—to ensure uniform implementation by issuing clear guidelines that are evaluated and reviewed. There is an urgent need for training of law enforcement officials, service providers, and judiciary.<sup>16</sup> Law enforcement officials are one of the most important sets of actors in the fight to combat trafficking, however their training has been sporadic. Victims' rights, victims' protection, and proper identification of what a victim is, are the emerging norms on how to deal domestically with trafficking.

Despite its broad language, the Trafficking Protocol, which entered into force at the end of 2003, can be used by states as a baseline for implementing policies that address both the criminal aspect of trafficking to which the Transnational Organized Crime Convention can be applied, and also for implementing measures to prevent trafficking and protect victims. One obvious problem of the Protocol is that its provisions regarding protection are non-binding. Therefore the only way to place pressure on states is through monitoring, sanctions, and other forms of political pressure.<sup>17</sup> Transnational advocacy networks have much work to do to pressure governments. After all, what is the incentive for countries to pass anti-trafficking legislation which they will be expected to enforce? There are challenges in truly combating the problem that have to do with addressing the inequalities in global capitalist system and addressing the demand. If the United States, European states, and Australia expect that people will stop wanting to come to the West, the economies of sending countries will have to

### *Transnational Activism to Combat Trafficking in Persons*

improve, and this must address growing inequalities amongst the world's richest and poorest countries. All countries' societies must address the inequality of women in their society and the demand for sex.

#### TENSIONS IN TRANSNATIONAL ACTIVISM AGAINST TRAFFICKING

The purpose of the preceding section on transnational activism is to follow briefly the historical patterns of how we have come to where we are with this issue of trafficking and how we have come to understand it. The following three themes, in my opinion, represent the current sources of the greatest tensions in the anti-trafficking world of academics and policy makers. Until we accept that only a balanced understanding of this extremely complex issue will lead us to sound policy, anti-trafficking work will be marked by extremism and narrow-thinking.

#### *Sex Trafficking Versus Labor Trafficking*

One of the political outcomes to a general growing awareness of the problem of trafficking is the emphasis on sex trafficking of women and girls to the exclusion of labor trafficking and migrant smuggling. Although trafficking, which is distinctly marked by violence, force, fraud, or coercion, is egregious in any form, the idea that someone would pay to sexually abuse or rape a child or woman is unfathomable, and moves us to want to save these victims of heinous crimes. It is likely that only the traffickers themselves would support the violent exploitation of women and children, and therefore, the cause of combating sex trafficking could have few detractors. This phenomenon has allowed the U.S. government, for example, to convince other governments all over the world that sex trafficking is a grave human rights violation and must be addressed with effective measures. In fact, activists and policy makers in Washington, D.C., reinvigorated the rhetoric that human trafficking was a form of *human slavery* in order to distinguish sex trafficking from prostitution; this proved extremely successful with the passage of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000.<sup>18</sup>

Although accurate statistics do not yet exist to reflect this assertion, service providers—lawyers, social workers, and health care professionals—are seeing a high, if not higher, occurrence of labor trafficking in the United States than sex trafficking in their everyday interactions with victims of trafficking. However, mainstream rhetoric over-emphasizes sex trafficking because of the images it conjures. The consequence of ignoring the demand for cheap or slave labor is labor trafficking. Agriculture and factory, as well as domestic service industries, absorb this labor in the United States, yet it is largely hidden from public view. Vidyamali Samarasinghe states that “‘trafficking’ in human cargo involves the movement of people, women and men, girls and boys, inter-

ANDREA M. BERTONE

nally and internationally, for work which may be illegal and under working conditions which are known to be exploitative.”<sup>19</sup> The demand for cheap labor on the part of hundreds of employers all over the world is as much to blame for trafficking as is the demand for sex by men. However, the economic realities of this are rarely acknowledged, let alone addressed.

### *Legalization Versus Abolition*

The recent focus on trafficking in general and sex trafficking in particular has rekindled the decades-long dispute between different camps of feminists. As stated above, one camp argues that sex work is a legitimate form of employment, which women should be able to choose if they wish. It advocates government legalization and regulation of sex work to protect women’s livelihood and health, and the health of the clients. Some argue that trafficking may be reduced in a country where the sex industry is regulated. The other camp argues that prostitution, whether voluntary or involuntary, is inherently exploitative, and that trafficking in all forms must be abolished. They seek the abolition of prostitution across the board and do not recognize a woman’s right to choose sex work as a profession. Some in this camp conflate prostitution with trafficking, calling ‘prostitutes’ and ‘victims of trafficking’ one in the same, and do so to certain political ends. Then there are those who straddle the middle, perhaps recognizing that prostitution is exploitative to the woman and the man, but recognize the economic necessity of women to prostitute themselves in order to feed their families, and understand the pitfalls of thinking of all prostitutes as victims. Each camp, when brought to its political extreme, can inform very different policies. One of the interesting outgrowths of the politicization of trafficking is that there is a growing awareness and understanding of the problem at many levels of analysis, so that opponents on opposite ends of the political spectrum agree that trafficking in women and girls for sexual exploitation in a narrowly defined form is something which should be stopped. However, the continued polarization of these groups, coupled with the fact that governments such as the U.S. government often interchange ‘prostitute’ and ‘victim of trafficking’, will not serve the best interests of the true victims of force, fraud or coercion.

The fact that we do not know if legalizing prostitution discourages or encourages trafficking is also a factor which exacerbates the polarization. We do know, based on the research of Chris Beyrer and Julie Stachowiak, among others, that “legalized sex work has shown to be highly safe and minimally involved in the transmission of HIV or other epidemics.”<sup>20</sup> I am encouraged by the recent U.S. State Department ‘Request for Proposals’ to fund a study which would seek to the understand relationship between prostitution in legislation and the effort to minimize severe forms of trafficking in persons.

*Supply versus Demand*

A third tension in the world of anti-trafficking activity is the over emphasis by NGOs, IOs and governments on the ‘supply’ side of the international sex trade and labor trafficking—that is, the children, women, and men who become ‘victims’ of trafficking, versus the ‘demand’ for the victims—that is, the sex tourists, the brothel owners, the traffickers, and employers. An over-emphasis on the supply side has a number of consequences. Although the practice is slowly changing, authorities in countries all over the world have systematically detained, jailed, and deported illegal aliens, without regard to whether they possibly have been trafficked. NGOs focus on providing psychological, medical, and social services to victims of trafficking. Academics and activists have become embroiled in the insolvable conflict between pro-prostitution and anti-prostitution arguments. Furthermore, there is still the problem of a lack of incentives for governments to address trafficking at all. As Mohamed Mattar writes, the threat of sanctions by the United States may not be an effective way to place pressure on other governments to treat victims of trafficking as victims, and not simply as criminals or illegal aliens.<sup>21</sup>

**Mohamed Mattar writes, the threat of sanctions by the United States may not be an effective way to place pressure on other governments to treat victims of trafficking as victims.**

Some countries, whose governments are becoming more sensitive to the complexities of trafficking and whose NGOs are highly experienced in dealing with victims, are developing multi-disciplinary teams to address the supply *and* demand sides of trafficking. For example, the United States, Italy, the Netherlands, and Belgium have fared better in prosecuting traffickers because they each, in their own way, provide residency permits to identified trafficked persons to enable them to access certain rights. It has been found that persons who are able to have a ‘reflection delay’ of at least three months which allows them to remain in the country legally while they recover from their situation are more likely to be willing to participate in efforts to prosecute traffickers. These states are funding shelters and providing victim and witness protection.<sup>22</sup> Thailand is having a difficult time convincing women to participate in prosecutions against traffickers because it does not give incentives and protection to them while they await the trial.

In terms of targeting the ‘demand’ for sex and cheap labor, there is less consistency across countries. One difficulty is that we do not know how much ‘demand’ is increasing. A handful of NGOs have specifically targeted men and their desire for sexual services. Sex tourism and militarized prostitution in Southeast and East Asia is


still a tremendously difficult problem. The United States, in its current efforts to reauthorize the Trafficking Victims Protection Act, is strengthening penalties against men who travel to other countries to have sex with minors. Sweden in 1999 took an unconditional prohibitionist approach to prostitution and trafficking and prohibited men from buying sex in Sweden.<sup>23</sup> This law has had a number of unfortunate consequences such as pushing prostitution underground and creating more dangerous conditions for women who choose to be prostitutes or those who are forced into the business.

The demand for cheap labor in which the labor becomes extremely exploitative is probably the most difficult aspect of trafficking to address, because it is wrapped in discussions of globalization and the mainstream capitalist market. In contrast to the data that was collected by the International Organization for Migration's Counter-Trafficking Module Database in Southeastern Europe in which the majority of cases (564 out of 826) was trafficking for sexual exploitation, many victims of trafficking in the United States in major metropolitan areas have been victims of agricultural, factory labor, or domestic servitude.<sup>24</sup> However, there is no central repository for data on trafficking in the United States. Millions of dollars have been made available by the U.S. government for combating domestic trafficking. Despite the fact that there is an Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons in the U.S. Department of State, there is no comparable domestic office which oversees the efforts to combat trafficking domestically.

20

Daan Everts writes about understanding supply and demand better so that more sound policies and programs can be designed.<sup>25</sup> He begins his article with a poignant story about a young woman who is lured by a smooth-talking trafficker to another country. The motivation for her to leave her country and look for a better life abroad is a motivation which encourages thousands of people, both men and women, to want to leave and seek a better life abroad. The West projects an image of wealth and success which would be alluring to anyone who is not so fortunate. However, the immigration policies of Western countries do not reflect the reality that the exportation of goods and perception of lifestyle is going to make people want a piece of that world. The pull of this world is so strong that people are willing to risk their lives to get to it. These realities are nuanced and it is more difficult to create policies to address them. Everts encouragingly signifies the role of the OSCE to strengthen the commitment of the governments of the 55 participating states. OSCE, an intergovernmental organization, is one key actor in a matrix of necessary actors to combat trafficking. The governments themselves must be committed to combating trafficking. Finally, countries need the help of nongovernmental organizations.

CONCLUSION

It is clear that this is only a cursory treatment of some of the major issues surrounding trafficking. I hope, however, that it further serves as a springboard for future discussion in this journal and others. As an academic and an activist, I, like many, have seen this issue explode on the international political scene, and I am fascinated with the extent to which NGOs, IOs and governments are working with one another (and working against one another) on this issue. The U.S. government plays a formidable role in maintaining this issue on the agenda, whether one agrees with its tactics or not. I am, however, also encouraged by the role of governments such as Thailand, which has become a regional leader on spearheading anti-trafficking activities. I applaud the extraordinary efforts of NGOs all over the world who contend with limited resources, the dangers of protecting victims from organized crime syndicates, and the unwillingness of governments to cooperate. 

NOTES

1. *The Brown Journal of World Affairs* (Summer/Fall 2003) vol. 10, issue 1.
2. The Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others Approved by General Assembly resolution 317(IV) of 2 December 1949 entry into force 25 July 1951, in accordance with article 24.
3. Kathleen Barry, *Female Sexual Slavery* (New York: New York University Press, 1979): 62-62.
4. Margaret E. Keck and Kathryn Sikkink, *Activists Beyond Borders*, (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1998): 178.
5. Karen Brown Thompson, "Women's Rights Are Human Rights." In Sanjeev Khagram, James V. Riker, Kathryn Sikkink (eds.), *Restructuring World Politics* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2002): 96-122.
6. *Ibid.*, 166.
7. *Ibid.*
8. *Ibid.*
9. Keck and Sikkink, *Activists Beyond Borders* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1998):188.
10. *Ibid.*, 183-188.
11. I use the term 'movement' loosely, and not according to the very strict definition put forth by transnational social movement theorists in the social sciences.
12. Franck Laczko and Marco A. Gramegna, "Developing Better Indicators of Human Trafficking." *Brown Journal of World Affairs* (Summer / Fall 2003) vol. 10, issue 1: 179-194.
13. Keck and Sikkink, 1998: 12.
14. There are exceptions, such as NGOs of recipient states addressing the donor state directly through embassy contact.
15. See *Human Traffic, Human Rights: Redefining Victim Protection*. Anti-Slavery International. London, 2002.
16. *Ibid.*
17. See Anne Gallagher 2001, Ann Jordan and Anti-Slavery International 2002.
18. The rhetoric used in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century was of a *white slave trade*.
19. *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 2003: 91.
20. *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 2003: 106.

ANDREA M. BERTONE

21. *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, (Summer/Fall 2003), vol. 10, issue 1.
22. Anti-Slavery International 2002: 2-3.
23. Susanne Thorbek and Bandana Pattanaik (eds), *Transnational Prostitution* (London: Zed Books, 2002)
24. Laczko and Gramegna, *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 2003: 189,
25. *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, (Summer/Fall 2003), vol. 10, issue 1.